



STATE OF NEW YORK  
OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

LETITIA JAMES  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

OFFICE OF FEDERAL INITIATIVES

January 26, 2021

Hon. George B. Daniels  
United States District Court  
Southern District of New York  
500 Pearl Street, Room 1310  
New York, NY 10007

Re: *Make the Road New York, et al. v. Kenneth Cuccinelli, et al.*, No. 19-cv-7993 (GBD) (“MRNY”); *State of New York, et al. v. U.S. Dep’t of Homeland Security, et al.*, 19-cv-7777 (GBD) (“State of New York”)

Dear Judge Daniels:

On January 19, 2021, Defendants filed a Notice of Agency Action (the “Notice”) stating that former Acting Secretary of Homeland Security Chad Wolf and Peter T. Gaynor had again taken actions purporting to ratify DHS’s public-charge rule. *See State of New York*, Dkt. 268; *MRNY*, Dkt. 289. Specifically, after briefing on Plaintiffs’ pending motion for partial summary judgment had already been completed, Wolf purported to designate Gaynor as Acting Secretary of Homeland Security. Gaynor then purported to delegate certain of his authorities as Acting Secretary back to Wolf, and Wolf purported to issue an order “‘affirm[ing] and ratify[ing]’ the Rule at issue in this case.” *State of New York*, Dkt. 268; *MRNY*, Dkt. 289.

These last minute actions, taken days before the new presidential administration took office, do not remedy the fatal defects in the appointment of Kevin McAleenan as former Acting Secretary of Homeland Security or his ultra vires issuance of the public-charge rule in violation of the Federal Vacancies Reform Act (“FVRA”) and the Administrative Procedure Act (“APA”). For example, as explained in Plaintiffs’ summary-judgment briefs, McAleenan’s invalid issuance of the public-charge rule cannot be ratified. *See* Mem. of Law in Supp. of Pls.’ Mot. for Partial Summary Judgment 25-26; Pls.’ Reply Mem. of Law 9-14. Moreover, neither Wolf nor Gaynor was validly exercising authority as Acting Secretary when they attempted this latest eleventh-hour ratification. At bottom, Defendants’ perfunctory actions are plainly an improper attempt to circumvent the statutory limits of the FVRA, the Homeland Security Act, and the APA.

In any event, Defendants have not to date set forth any position about the relevance of their purported ratification to the pending motions, and their January 25 letter did not address the issue. To the extent that Defendants intend to rely on their new actions or make arguments about

Page 2

them in support of Defendants' opposition to Plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgement and Defendants' motion to dismiss (*see State of New York*, Dkt. 249, Dkt. 259; *MRNY* Dkt. 276, Dkt. 286), or to the extent that the Court would find it useful, Plaintiffs respectfully request an opportunity to confer with Defendants regarding a schedule to file further submissions addressing Defendants' new actions.

Respectfully submitted,

**LETITIA JAMES**  
*Attorney General of the State of New York*

By: /s/ Amanda Meyer  
Amanda Meyer, *Assistant Attorney General*  
Judith N. Vale, *Senior Assistant Solicitor General*  
Abigail Rosner, *Assistant Attorney General*  
Office of the New York State Attorney General  
New York, New York 10005  
Phone: (212) 416-6225  
amanda.meyer@ag.ny.gov

*Attorneys for the State of New York*

**PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON &  
GARRISON LLP**

By: /s/ Jonathan H. Hurwitz  
Andrew J. Ehrlich  
Jonathan H. Hurwitz  
Robert J. O'Loughlin  
Daniel S. Sinnreich  
Leah Park

1285 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, New York 10019-6064  
(212) 373-3000  
aehrlich@paulweiss.com  
jhurwitz@paulweiss.com

roloughlin@paulweiss.com  
dsinnreich@paulweiss.com  
lpark@paulweiss.com

**CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS**

Ghita Schwarz

Baher Azmy

666 Broadway  
7th Floor  
New York, New York 10012  
(212) 614-6445

gschwarz@ccrjustice.org  
bazmy@ccrjustice.org

**THE LEGAL AID SOCIETY**

Susan E. Welber, Staff Attorney, Law Reform Unit

Kathleen Kelleher, Staff Attorney, Law Reform Unit

Susan Cameron, Supervising Attorney, Law Reform Unit

Hasan Shafiqullah, Attorney-in-Charge, Immigration Law Unit

199 Water Street, 3rd Floor  
New York, New York 10038

(212) 577-3320

sewelber@legal-aid.org

kkelleher@legal-aid.org

scameron@legal-aid.org

hhshafiqullah@legal-aid.org

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Make the Road New York, African Services Committee, Asian American Federation, Catholic Charities Community Services (Archdiocese of New York), and Catholic Legal Immigration Network, Inc.*

cc: All Counsel of record via ECF